The McAnulty College and Graduate School of Liberal Arts
of Duquesne University

Health Care Ethics Syllabus for: 652-61, Justice in Health Care
Instructor: Aaron L. Mackler, Ph.D.
Office: Fisher Hall 606 Ext: 5985
Fall, 2012 e-mail: mackler@duq.edu

Fisher Hall 554, 3:05-5:45, on Wednesday, Aug 29, Sep 19, Oct 17, Nov 14, and Dec 5

Office Hours: 2:00-3:00 before class meetings; and by appointment

1. Objectives of the Course:

   A. Catalogue Description: An examination of religious, philosophical, and policy perspectives on theoretical understandings of justice and on practical issues involving the allocation and delivery of health care, such as access to health care, health care reform, rationing, and managed care.

   B. Type of Mastery to be Expected: Upon completion of the course, students may expect to: 1) have a basic comprehension of general philosophical and religious understandings of justice; 2) be familiar with influential concepts of justice and health care, including their relation to theories of justice; 3) be familiar with central issues and positions related to access to health care and rationing, including the significance of cost-effectiveness; 4) be aware of emerging issues in relation to managed care and organizational ethics; 5) develop the ability to analyze the relations between theories of justice, general conceptualizations of justice in health care, and more specific applied issues; 6) be able to draw on this ability in critically evaluating positions on these topics, and in formulating their own position.

This course should contribute to students meeting general HCE program learning outcomes:
a. Fundamental knowledge: students can understand and analyze HCE theory and methods as well as major applied topics.
b. Multi-disciplinary study: students can critically relate HCE with multi-disciplinary fields in health care as a diverse and global enterprise.
c. Scholarship: students can research and write scholarly essays, teach and communicate effectively, and present academic papers that present cogent arguments, engage scholarly literature, and demonstrate critical thinking and analysis.
d. Professionalism: students can integrate academic learning with experiential learning in clinical/organizational rotations as a function of service-learning and development as an HCE professional.
e. Ethical leadership: students can function as HCE expert and provide ethical leadership, with the knowledge, skills, competencies and character traits to provide ethics services.

f. Co-curricular practices for life-long learning: students can foster co-curricular practices for life-long learning to personally value and engage the clinical, organizational, and professional components of HCE in a global context.

2. Textbooks Required:


3. Supplementary Materials: Selected additional readings will be posted on Blackboard, distributed in class, or available on reserve in the library.

4. Procedures: Individual reading, thought, and writing of papers, supplemented by discussion and lecture at five class meetings.

5. Schedule:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Event</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Aug 29</td>
<td>Seminar 1, Introduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sept 13</td>
<td>submit RP1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sept 19</td>
<td>Seminar 2, introduce RP 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oct 11</td>
<td>submit RP2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oct 17</td>
<td>Seminar 3, introduce RP3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oct 25</td>
<td>submit proposal for research essay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oct 29-Nov 2</td>
<td>Individual meeting to discuss research essay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nov 8</td>
<td>submit RP3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nov 14</td>
<td>Seminar 4, discuss research essays</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dec 5</td>
<td>Seminar 5, oral presentation of essay, essay due</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dec 12</td>
<td>Final draft of research essay due</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6. Assignments: Three papers of about 10 pages each, due September 13, October 11 and November 8. One final paper of about 30 pages due December 12, with oral presentation December 5, preceded by submission of proposal and discussion. For all work, please
attend to: development and justification of your argument; critical analysis in the organization of the argument; and integration of the literature in making the argument.

For RP 1, compare and contrast the views of John Stuart Mill and John Rawls on justice. What is justice? How does it relate to other values? What reasons and arguments does each author present to persuade the reader? What is your evaluation?

For RP2, compare and contrast the approach to Justice in Health Care of Norman Daniels and another approach, such as Catholic or libertarian views. Sketch the authors’ understandings of justice in general. Discuss their general conceptualizations of justice in health care. Consider the implications for a sample issue or case. What reasons and arguments does each author present to persuade the reader? What is your evaluation?

For RP3, compare and contrast the views of two authors on the extent and limits of society’s obligation to assure the provision of health care. By what criteria and process should decisions about priorities and particular cases be made? Should there be “rationing,” in what sense of the term? What reasons and arguments does each author present to persuade the reader? What is your evaluation?

For the research essay, explore a topic in depth, reflecting your proposal submitted October 25.

6. Collateral Reading: None required. Some additional sources for those interested in a particular topic will be noted in class; please see the instructor for additional suggestions.

Valuable resources include:

(via Gumberg) Encyclopedia of Bioethics, 3d ed., Electronic Resources
bioethics.georgetown.edu (Bioethics Research Library at Georgetown University)
search databases, including ETHXWeb
bioethics.net American Journal of Bioethics
chausa.org Catholic Health Association of the United States

7. Tests: None.

8. Grade Evaluation: Each of the three written research projects counts for 10%, and the final research essay counts for 70% of the final grade. Class attendance and participation throughout the semester are required, and will be considered in determining the final grade. The plus-minus grading system will be used.

9. This syllabus incorporates the “Expectations of Academic Integrity.” Cheating and plagiarism will not be tolerated. All relevant policies of the McAnulty College and Graduate School of Liberal Arts apply.
Students with documented disabilities are entitled to reasonable accommodations if needed. If you need accommodations, please contact the Office of Freshman Development and Special Student Services in 309 Duquesne Union (412-396-6657) as soon as possible. Accommodations cannot always be granted retrospectively.

10. Course content: The schedule of topics and readings is subject to revision by the instructor.

Seminar 1, August 29: Introduction

A. Justice: Mill and Rawls

Lebacqz, Karen. Six Theories of Justice, 9-50

Rawls, John, A Theory of Justice, pages 3-46, 52-81, 102-76 (sections 1-9, 11-15, 20-31)

Westphal, Jonathan, ed. Justice, 157-77 (presenting Mill, Utilitarianism, ch. 5)

RP1 due September 13

B. Justice and Health Care

Seminar 2, September 19

Lebacqz, 51-82

Westphal, xi-xxv, 7-21, 73-94, (Introduction and selections by Nozick and Aristotle)


Cahill LS, Theological Bioethics, 131-68

Vicini A, “Health Care Reform in the United States”

May WF, Testing the Medical Covenant, 99-110, 126-35


Daniels, Norman, Just Health: Meeting Health Needs Fairly, 1-158

Dougherty CJ, American Health Care, 115-32, 181-90


Veatch RM, “Justice, the Basic Social Contract, and Health Care,” from A Theory of Medical Ethics, in Contemporary Issues in Bioethics, Beauchamp TL and Walters L eds, 566-71

Hastings Center, Connecting American Values with Health Reform, ii-iii, 1-20

RP 2 due October 11

C. Limits, Rationing, and Managed Care

Seminar 3, October 17


Catholic Health Association, With Justice for All? The Ethics of Healthcare Rationing


Daniels N and Sabin JE, Setting Limits Fairly, 2d ed. (2008), 13-46


Morreim, E. Haavi, Balancing Act: The New Medical Ethics of Medicine’s New Economics


Research essay proposal: submit October 25
individual discussion October 29-November 2

RP3 due November 8

Seminar 4, November 14, discuss research essays

Seminar 5, December 5, oral presentation of essays

Final draft of research essay due December 12