DUQUESNE UNIVERSITY
CENTER FOR HEALTHCARE ETHICS
McANULTY COLLEGE AND GRADUATE SCHOOL OF LIBERAL ARTS

COURSE HCE-655: GLOBAL BIOETHICS

Fall 2012 (version 8 July 2012)
OUTLINE

One of the new and exciting features of present-day healthcare ethics is that it is increasingly incorporated in an ethical discourse that is globally orientated. Although the terminology is older, nowadays global bioethics is highlighted as the broader discourse for discussing and analyzing ethical issues in relation to medicine, healthcare and emerging technologies. This course will study the concept as well as contents of global bioethics. As an international enterprise, global bioethics is closely connected to international human rights law. International organizations such as UNESCO (the United Nations Educational Scientific and Cultural Organization, headquartered in Paris) and WHO (the World Health Organizations, headquartered in Geneva) are active in the field of global bioethics, particularly in relation to developing countries. Fundamental bioethical principles have been determined which are shared among all nations and that form a global framework for the analysis of ethical issues around the globe. This course will extensively pay attention to this global ethical framework, including principles such as human dignity, respect for cultural diversity, solidarity, sharing of benefits, and protection of future generations. Finally, the course will demonstrate how to apply the fundamental principles in the analysis and debate of specific ethical issues in diverging contexts and countries, for example in other religious traditions, in low-income countries, and in international cooperation and exchange.

COURSE OBJECTIVES

a) Course description. The course will make students familiar with the recent issues and debates in bioethics as well as its evolution from traditional medical ethics into present-day global bioethics. In particular it will explain basic notions of global bioethics, as identified in the Universal Declaration on Bioethics and Human Rights, unanimously adopted by the 193 Members States of UNESCO in 2005. The focus will be on universal principles such as human dignity and human rights, respect for human vulnerability and personal integrity, respect for cultural diversity and pluralism, solidarity and cooperation, social responsibility and health, sharing of benefits, protecting future generations, and protection of the
environment, the biosphere and biodiversity. The course will also study the applications of the fundamental principles in various settings around the world.

b) **Research competencies.** Upon completion of the course students should master the following competencies, as should be demonstrated both in specific research projects and presentations, and in the research essay:

a. Historical analysis of the development of global bioethics as well as the emergence of human rights discourse especially at international level;

b. Systematic examination of the fundamental ethical principles of global bioethics;

c. Critical analysis of the application of the fundamental ethical principles in various specific practices and policies, and in different areas of the world.

c) **General HCE Program Learning Outcomes.** All of these Learning Outcomes pertain to HCE-655.

a. **Fundamental Knowledge.**

Students can understand and analyze HCE theory and methods as well as major applied topics.

b. **Multi-disciplinary Study.**

Students can critically relate HCE with multi-disciplinary fields in health care as a diverse and global enterprise (empirical research, law, medicine, philosophy, religion, science, etc).

c. **Scholarship**

Students can research and write scholarly essays, teach and communicate effectively, and present academic papers that:

- present cogent arguments(s),
- engage scholarly literature, and
- demonstrate critical thinking and analysis.

d. **Professionalism**

Students can integrate academic learning with experiential learning in clinical/organizational rotations as a function of service-learning and development as an HCE professional.

e. **Ethical Leadership**

Students can function as HCE expert and provide ethical leadership, with the knowledge, skills, competencies and character traits to provide ethics services (ethics consultations, ethics committees, institutional review boards, etc.).

f. **Co-Curricular Practices for Life-long Learning**

Students can foster co-curricular practices for life-long learning to personally value and engage the clinical, organizational, and professional components of HCE in a global context. Practice include: accessing journals and literature for developments in HCE; networking with colleagues in professional associations; fostering a community of scholars in the HCE program, for example, participating in seminars/colloquia/speaker events, preparing for comprehensive exams, writing doctoral projects.
COURSE PROCEDURES.

a) Course components
The Fall semester will be divided into four components:

i. Research Project #1 (10 pages), week 1-4; due Friday September 21 for Seminar #2, September 25.

ii. Research Project #2 (10 pages), week 5-8; due Friday October 19 for Seminar #3, October 23.

iii. Research Project #3 (10 pages), week 9-13; due Friday November 23 for Seminar #4, November 27.

   2. Option to submit mid-term essay. For students who want to be assisted in their progress, a draft of the essay can be submitted for feedback; by Friday October 19.
   3. Submit Research Essay by Friday December 7, 5:00 pm.

b) Research projects

1. Reading Requirements. Each Research Project will require students to critically engage the equivalent of 3 books to (a) master the relevant knowledge and (b) engage in critical reading and writing.

2. Research competencies. The research competencies in the course are identified by the three Research Projects: (a) historical analysis, (b) systematic examination of fundamental ethical principles, and (c) critical analysis of the application of the fundamental ethical principles in a specialized area of concern. Each Research Project will demonstrate that the student has mastered the specific competency.

3. Relation of Projects with Essay. The three Research Projects may be integrated into the Research (or Course) Essay but not in a manner of cut-and-paste from one to the other. The Research Essay typically demonstrates that the student can apply and integrate all three research competencies in relation to a specific topic or issue in research ethics. While the research papers are focused on one specific competency, the course essay must demonstrate all three competencies. The course essay furthermore is based on a self-selected thesis different for each students, while the topics of the research papers are given and similar for all students.

4. Projects:
   i. Research competency of historical analysis:
      Project RP # 1:
      Research question: How and why is the development of global bioethics related to the emergence of the human rights discourse?
      Format: write a paper of exactly 10 pages (1.5 line spacing;
exclusive title page and table of content) plus minimally 30 endnotes with references and a bibliography.

**Required reading**


**ii. Research competency of systematic examination of fundamental ethical principles of global bioethics:**

**Project RP # 2:**

The notion of common heritage of humankind is used as the foundation for several of the ethical principles in the UNESCO Universal Declaration on Bioethics and Human Rights.

a. Explain which principles are particularly justified with the notion of common heritage of humankind;

b. How can the notion of common heritage of humankind also be used to argue that the ethical principles of the Declaration are really universal principles that are shared globally regardless of religion, tradition and socio-cultural context?

**Format:** Write of paper of exactly 10 pages (1.5 line spacing; exclusive title page and table of content) plus minimally 30 references/end notes and bibliography.

**Required Readings:**

4. The Chapters of Jan Helge Solbakk and Agomoni Ganguli-Mitra/ Nikola Biller-Andorno on vulnerability in Ruth Chadwick, Henk ten Have and Eric M. Meslin (eds): *The
iii. Research competency of critical analysis of the application of the fundamental ethical principles in various specific practices and policies, and in different areas of the world.

Project RP # 3:

How can the fundamental ethical principles of global bioethics clarify practical problems at international level?

Explain in particular:

a. Which ethical principles are most useful to explain the ethical issues in the specific area of concern?

b. Is it justified to modify the principles according to the context so that what is prohibited in one country should be permitted in other countries? Explain why or why not.

Format: Write a paper of exactly 10 pages (1.5 line spacing; exclusive title page and table of content) plus minimally 30
Required Readings:
1. Select one area of special concern:
   a. Migration of health professionals
   b. Islamic bioethics
   c. Organ sale
2. Select the requested readings for your selected area (see at the last pages of this Syllabus). Each area requires you to read publications that are outstanding in this area. There is no requirement to read the literature for the specialized areas that you have not selected.

c) Research Seminars. There will be four seminars introducing each of the three research competencies.
1. **Week 1.** Seminar #1 to introduce Research Project #1
   i. Introduction to the course
   ii. Introduction to the area of global bioethics
   iii. Discussion of research project requirements and course essay
   iv. Course essay thesis and 1-page outline with basic bibliography to be submitted by end of week 4
2. **Week 5.** Seminar #2 to introduce Research Project #2
   i. Discussion of progress on research essays
   ii. Presentations of completed Research Project #1
3. **Week 9.** Seminar #3 to introduce Research Project #3
   i. Discussion of progress on research essays
   ii. Discussion of completed Research Project # 2
4. **Week 13.** Seminar #4 to discuss the Course Essay
   i. Discussion of completed Research Project # 3
   ii. Brief presentations (10 min) of the course essays

d) Course essay. The course research essay will require students to substantively apply the Research Competencies of this course to a particular issue (theoretical or practical). Requirements:
1. Start to reflect on the thesis of your course essay from the beginning of the course.
2. Thesis and 1-page outline with basic bibliography to be submitted by the end of week 4 (September 21) (email to tenhaveh@duq.edu).
3. You will receive feedback in or before Seminar #2.
4. Progress will be reported in the subsequent Seminars.
5. Each student will briefly present the course essay (max. 8 minutes) during the final Seminar and submit a copy of the essay by date assigned.
6. The course essay length should be **30 pages**, double-spacing; this concerns the main body of text; title page, table of content, endnotes and bibliography do not count within the 30 pages.
7. Students must adopt the format of the *Chicago Manual of Style*, as required by the College for dissertation submissions.
8. Select an Essay Title that reflects a research thesis. For example the thesis can be:
   i. “The ethical principle of respect for human vulnerability is particularly important to protect people in developing countries”, or
   ii. “What are the ethical justifications of the principle of benefit sharing”
   The title will then be something like:
   a. Human vulnerability and developing countries
   b. Ethics and benefit sharing
9. Make a Title page and a separate Table of Content.
10. Present a brief Introduction and Conclusion.
11. Notes to the references made in the essay.
   i. Use end notes (as opposed to foot notes at the bottom of the page).
   ii. Do not use notes for narrative explanations – they belong in the main text.
   iii. There should be approximately 100 end notes in the essay.
12. Bibliography. List all the references in alphabetical order following the last name of the (first) author. Only list items actually referred to in the essay.
13. Divisions and subdivisions. Use major divisions (headings) and subdivisions (subheadings), evenly distributed throughout the essay, to lay out the sequence of concepts and arguments.
14. Use of online references. Online references must be accurately identified with complete web address etc, including the date of access.

**HCE HANDBOOK.** The Center for Healthcare ethics has developed a *Handbook* of Policies, Procedures, and Guidelines to guide students in all curriculum related matters.

**COURSE GRADE.** There will be no examinations. The course grade will be assigned based on the quality of the course research essay and the three research projects. The grade will be a combination of 10% for each of the three research projects and 70% for the final essay.

No midterm grades will be assigned. End of term grades will be assigned adopting grading policy in the McAnulty College and Graduate School of Liberal Arts, as follows:

- A 4.0 distinguished scholarly work
- A- 3.7
- B+ 3.3
- B 3.0 normal progress towards degree
- B- 2.7
- C+ 2.3
- C 2.0 warning; student subject to departmental action
- F 0.0
ACADEMIC INTEGRITY. This syllabus incorporates the “Expectations of Academic Integrity.” Cheating and plagiarism cannot be tolerated. All relevant policies of the McAnulty College and Graduate School of Liberal Arts apply.

REASONABLE ACCOMMODATIONS.
Students with documented disabilities are entitled to reasonable accommodations if needed. If you need accommodations, please contact the Office of Freshman Development and Special Student Services in 309 Duquesne Union (412-396-6657) as soon as possible. Accommodations cannot always be granted retrospectively.
COURSE READINGS

HCE 655, Global bioethics, 2012 Fall

Required reading:

1. General texts for all students (all books need to be read by all students):

2. The journal articles will be available through the Gumberg Library e-reserves. The link to the readings is: [http://guides.library.duq.edu/er.php?ecid=6799](http://guides.library.duq.edu/er.php?ecid=6799).
   The password is: HCE655

3. Specialised texts depending on the area of practical application (following your choice of one area); here you only have to study the literature in your area of choice. Three areas of application of the fundamental principles are available:
   a. Migration of healthcare professionals
   b. Islamic bioethics
   c. Organ sale

Research competency #1: Historical analysis


**Research competency #2: Systematic examination of the fundamental ethical principles of global bioethics**

**a. The principles of global bioethics**


UNESCO Universal Declaration on Cultural Diversity, 2001
http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0012/001271/127160m.pdf


Report of the IBC on solidarity and international co-operation between developed and developing countries concerning the human genome. UNESCO, 2001.
http://portal.unesco.org/shs/en/file_download.php/559ac31d0288b0aa0d7886a707826cfc Solidarity_en.pdf

International Bioethics Committee: Report on social responsibility, 2010


b. Common heritage of humankind


Research competency #3: Critical analysis of the application of the fundamental ethical principles in various specific practices and policies, and in different areas of the world

a. Migration of healthcare professionals


**b. Islamic bioethics**


Abdallah Daar and A. Khitamy: Bioethics for clinicians: 21. Islamic bioethics. *Canadian Medical Association Journal* 2001; 164(1): 60-63 ([http://www.cmja.ca/cgi/content/full/164/1/60](http://www.cmja.ca/cgi/content/full/164/1/60)).


c. Organ sale


**COURSE SCHEDULE**

**Tuesday August 28, 2012. Seminar #1**

**Research competency #1: Historical analysis**

**Project #1**

September 4, 11 and 18, Research Project #1
Submit Project #1 by Fri. Sept 21
Submit Essay Thesis, 1-page outline, basic bibliography, by Fri. Sept 21

**Tuesday September 25, 2012. Seminar #2**
Research competency #2: Systematic examination of the fundamental ethical principles of global bioethics
Project #2
October 2, 9 and 16, Research Project #2
Submit Project #2 by Fri. October 19

Tuesday October 23, 2012. Seminar #3
Research competency #3: Critical analysis of the application of the fundamental ethical principles in various specific practices and policies, and in different areas of the world
Project #3
October 30, November 6 and 13, Research Project #3
Submit Project 3# by Fri. November 23.

Tuesday November 27, 2012. Seminar #4
Course essay
Submit Course Essay by Friday, December 7, 5:00 pm.