

College: McAnulty College and Graduate School of Liberal Arts.

Syllabus: HCE-659, Methods in Health Care Ethics, Fall 2017. Revised: 3/31/17.

Course: Thursday 3:05-5:45pm.

Classroom: Fisher Hall tba.

Office Hours: Indicated on Blackboard for the course. Fisher 300 suite.

Course Instructor: Gerard Magill, Ph.D., The Vernon F. Gallagher Chair for the Integration of Science, Theology, Philosophy and Law and Professor of Healthcare Ethics Duquesne University [e-mail: [magillg@duq.edu](mailto:magillg@duq.edu)].

### **COURSE DESCRIPTION.**

This course provides a foundational introduction to HCE and to other doctoral degree courses in the healthcare ethics curriculum. The course presents an analysis of dominant methods in healthcare ethics from historical, systematic, and religious perspectives. Practical issues are engaged to illustrate methodological issues.

### **COURSE OBJECTIVES.**

The course focuses on developing Research Competencies in the Research Projects and the Research Essay to prepare students for writing the Doctoral Dissertation. There are three standards adopted in the HCE program for evaluating Research Projects and the Research Essays, as follows: Argument Formation; Literature Integration; Critical Organization and Analysis. The Research Competencies, Projects, and Essay are integrated into the Course Schedule, each described below.

### **LEARNING OUTCOMES.**

- a. Fundamental Knowledge.  
Students can understand and analyze HCE theory and methods as well as major applied topics
- b. Multi-disciplinary Study.  
Students can critically relate HCE with multi-disciplinary fields in health care as a diverse and global enterprise (empirical research, law, medicine, philosophy, religion, science, etc).
- c. Scholarship.  
Students can research and write scholarly essays, teach and communicate effectively, and present academic papers that:
  - present cogent argument(s),
  - engage scholarly literature, and
  - demonstrate critical analysis and organization.
- d. Professionalism.  
Students can integrate academic learning with experiential learning in clinical/organizational rotations as a function of service-learning and development as an HCE professional
- e. Ethical Leadership.  
Students can function as HCE expert and provide ethical leadership, with the knowledge, skills, competencies and character traits to provide ethics services (ethics consultations, ethics committees, institutional review boards, etc).

f. Co-Curricular Practices for Life-long Learning.

Can foster co-curricular practices for life-long learning to personally value and engage the clinical, organizational, and professional components of HCE in a global context. Practices include: accessing journals and literature for developments in HCE; networking with colleagues in professional associations; fostering a community of scholars in the HCE program, for example, participating in seminars/colloquia/speaker events, preparing for comprehensive exams, writing doctoral projects.

**RESEARCH COMPETENCIES.**

The course is designed around three Research Competencies regarding methods in health care ethics: historical analysis, systematic analysis, and religious analysis. These research competencies will be integrated into the Research Projects and Research Essay.

1. HISTORICAL ANALYSIS: Historical Development of HCE Methods. The purpose is to understand from an historical perspective how normative methods in HCE have developed. This is explained via class presentations and student group discussion of the assigned texts. See the two weeks listed below. No Research Project is required for this 1<sup>st</sup> research competency.

Required Reading:

- Albert R. Jonsen, *The Birth of Bioethics* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1998), chapters 1-4 and 10-11.
- Albert R. Jonsen, *A Short History of Medical Ethics* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2008), chapters 7-8.

2. SYSTEMATIC ANALYSIS: HCE Methods to Clarify Normativity & Principles. The purpose is to understand from a systematic perspective HCE methods to clarify moral normativity & principles. This is explained via class presentations and student group discussion of the assigned texts. In the final week of this section students will submit a 7-page Research Project with minimally 20 note references on the assigned readings. The Research Project will require students to critically engage the assigned readings to (a) master the relevant knowledge and (b) engage in critical reading and writing. The goal is to provide an analysis of HCE methods to clarify moral normativity & principles.

Required Reading:

- Jeremy Sugarman and Daniel P. Sulmasy, ed. *Methods in Medical Ethics* (Washington, DC: Georgetown University Press, 2010), chapters 1, 3, 5, 7.
- Tom L. Beauchamp and James F. Childress, *Principles of Biomedical Ethics*, 7<sup>th</sup> ed, (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013), chapters 1, 4, 5, 6, 7.

3. RELIGIOUS ANALYSIS: Religious Methods in HCE. The purpose is to understand how religious approaches constitute distinct methods in HCE. This is explained via class presentations and student group discussion of the assigned

texts. In the final week of this section students will submit a 7-page Research Project with minimally 20 note references on the assigned readings. The Research Project will require students to critically engage the assigned readings to (a) master the relevant knowledge and (b) engage in critical reading and writing. The goal is to provide an analysis of religious approaches as distinct methods in HCE.

Required Readings:

- David F. Kelly, Gerard Magill, Henk ten Have, *Contemporary Catholic Health Care Ethics*, 2<sup>nd</sup> edition (Washington, D.C: Georgetown University Press, 2013), chapters 10, 12-16, 18-20, 22, 25.
- Aaron L. Mackler, *Introduction to Jewish and Catholic Bioethics: A Comparative Analysis* (Washington, D.C: Georgetown University Press, 2003), chapters 1-4.
- Christopher Kaczor, *A Defense of Dignity* (Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 2013), chapters 10, 11.

4. COURSE RESEARCH ESSAY. The course research essay will integrate the research competencies of the course implementing the three standards of the program (argument, literature, critical organization & analysis). The essay will be 25 pages with minimally 100 note references. The course readings in their entirety (not just the assigned chapters indicated above for weekly class discussion) should be used in the course essay combined with additional readings by the student reflecting the selected topic.

Essay Options. There are two general options for the essay, as follows.

- a. Option 1. Methods of Ethical Decision-making. This can be a theoretical analysis (such as on autonomy & surrogacy), a practical analysis (such as on ethics consultation processes), or a combination of theoretical and practical discourse.
- b. Option 2. Applying Normative Principles to Practical Topics. The normative component can be secular (e.g., burden/benefit calculus) or religious (e.g., double effect). The practical component deals with patient dilemmas (e.g. at the start of life).

Essay Timelines. The following timeline indicates the stages of the essay.

- Week 3 (Sep.7): 1-page essay title, outline, and basic bibliography.
- Week 11 (Nov.2): 5-page developed outline with complete bibliography.
- Weeks 11 (Nov.2) onwards: class presentations on essays in progress.
- Final class (Nov.30): essays due (sent electronically).

Integrating Research Competencies & Research Essay. Drafts of the Research Essay are discussed in class during weeks 11 onwards, with the final essay to be submitted electronically by the last class on Nov. 30. The Research Essay engages the research competencies (historical, systematic, religious analysis). Because the purpose is integration of analysis, students may not simply “cut and paste” the

Research Projects into the essay. The Research Essay should adopt the Course Readings and additional literature related to the selected topic.

Essay Requirements:-

1. Start research from the beginning of the course.
2. Submit Essay Thesis and 1-page outline with basic bibliography.
3. Progress will be reported in the Seminars.
4. Focus on Research Essay progress during the final Seminar.
5. Submit a copy of the essay by date assigned.
6. The essay length should be **25 pages**, double-spacing.
7. Adopt the format of the *Chicago Manual of Style*, as required by the College for dissertation submissions.
8. Provide a Cover Page (name and essay title) plus an Essay Outline.
9. Present a brief Introduction and Conclusion.
10. Notes to the references made in the essay.
  - a. Use end notes (as opposed to foot notes at the bottom of the page).
  - b. Do not use notes for narrative explanations – they belong in the text.
  - c. There should be approx. 100 end notes in the essay.
  - d. Avoid repeat references to pages from the same resource.
11. Bibliography. List all the references in alphabetical order by author. Only list items actually referred to in the essay.
12. Use of online references. Online references are not permitted.
13. Divisions and subdivisions. Use major divisions and subdivisions, evenly distributed throughout the essay, for example:

Title: The ethical justification of mandating patient safety programs in health care organizations.

  - I. Introduction.
  - II. The organizational ethics problem of medical error.
    - a. The range of medical problems.
    - b. The range of organizational problems.
  - III. The ethical principles that guide systems for patient safety.
    - a. Principle 1: Protection of Patients from Medical Error.
    - b. Principle 2. Systems to Enhance Quality Improvement.
  - IV. The policy options for stem cell research.
    - a. Federal Oversight: an independent board.
    - b. Joint Commission Accreditation Policy.
  - V. The ethical justification of practical policy options for stem cell research.
    - a. Justifying oversight proposal A.
    - b. Justifying accreditation policy B.
  - VI. Conclusion.
  - VII. End Notes & Bibliography of references cited.

## COURSE READINGS.

Tom L. Beauchamp and James F. Childress, *Principles of Biomedical Ethics*, 7<sup>th</sup> ed, (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013).

Albert R. Jonsen, *The Birth of Bioethics* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1998).

Albert R. Jonsen, *A Short History of Medical Ethics* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2008).

Christopher Kaczor, *A Defense of Dignity* (Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 2013).

David F. Kelly, Gerard Magill, Henk ten Have, *Contemporary Catholic Health Care Ethics*, 2<sup>nd</sup> edition (Washington, D.C: Georgetown University Press, 2013).

Aaron L. Mackler, *Introduction to Jewish and Catholic Bioethics: A Comparative Analysis* (Washington, D.C: Georgetown University Press, 2003).

Jeremy Sugarman and Daniel P. Sulmasy, ed. *Methods in Medical Ethics* (Washington, DC: Georgetown University Press, 2010).

## SUPPLEMENTARY READINGS (by course instructor, posted in Blackboard):

Gerard Magill, "Using the Imagination in Normative Moral Reasoning around the Principle of Double Effect to foster Doctrinal Development in Catholic Bioethics." In, J. Gielen, ed, *Moral Normativity*, Springer 2017, chapter 6, forthcoming 2017.

Gerard Magill, "Clinical Ethics: Accreditation." In, H. ten Have & B. Gordijn, eds., *Encyclopedia of Global Bioethics* (Springer, 2016).

Gerard Magill, "Quality in Ethics Consultations," *Medicine, Health Care and Philosophy* 16:4 (2013): 761-774.

Gerard Magill, "Threat of Imminent Death in Pregnancy: A Role for Double Effect Reasoning," *Theological Studies* 72 (December 2011): 848-878.

Brian Devlin & Gerard Magill, "The Process of Ethical Decision Making," *Best Practice & Research Clinical Anaesthesiology* 20:4 (2006): 493-506.

Gerard Magill, et al, *ASBH Task Force Report on Ethics Consultation Liability* (ASBH, 2004).

## COURSE SCHEDULE, TOPICS, & READINGS.

Note: course books must be studied in full for the relevant RPs and for the research essay.

<u>Dates</u>	<u>Weeks</u>	<u>Weekly Topics</u>	<u>Readings for Weekly Class Discussion:</u>
		<u>I-HISTORY</u>	
8/24	Week-1	Roots of Methods	Jonsen, Birth of Bioethics, ch. 1, 2, 3, 4.
8/31	Week-2	Disciplinary Discourse	Jonsen, Birth of Bioethics, ch. 10, 11. Jonsen, Short History, ch. 7, 8.
		<u>II-SYSTEMATICS</u>	
9/7 *due	Week-3 <u>1p Essay Plan due</u>	Diversity of Methods	Sugarman, Methods, ch. 1, 3, 5, 7.
9/14	Week-4	Moral Normativity	Beauchamp, Principles, ch. 1, 4.
9/21	Week-5	Burden/Benefit Calculus	Beauchamp, Principles, ch. 5, 6.
9/28 *due	Week-6 <u>RP-1 due</u>	Justice & Culture	Beauchamp, Principles, ch. 7.
		<u>III-RELIGION</u>	
10/5	Week-7	RC Methods, I	Kelly, Catholic, ch. 10, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16.
10/12	Week-8	RC Methods, II	Kelly, Catholic, ch. 18, 19, 20, 22, 25.
10/19	Week-9	Jewish Methods	Mackler, Jewish, ch. 1, 2, 3.
10/26 *due	Week-10 <u>RP-2 due</u>	Comparative RC / Jewish Methods	Mackler, Jewish, ch. 4. Kaczor, Dignity, ch. 10, 11.
		<u>IV-ESSAYS</u>	
11/2 *due	Week-11 <u>5p Essay Plan due</u>	Student Essays	Research Essay Literature.
11/9	Week-12	Student Essays	Research Essay Literature.
11/16	Week-13	Student Essays	Research Essay Literature.
11/23	Thnksgvng	x x x	x x x
11/30 *due	Last Class: <u>Essay due</u>	Course Review	x x x

## BLACKBOARD.

Blackboard will be used for course communications, access to PowerPoint presentations, and video-taped weekly classes. Streaming of weekly classes is available for distance students with links via Blackboard.

**COURSE GRADE.**

There will be no examinations. The course grade will be assigned based on the quality of the course Research Essay and the two Research Projects. The grade will be a combination of 15% for each of the Research Projects (50% for class presentations on project readings and 50% for the written project) and 70% for the final essay. No midterm grades will be assigned. End of term grades will be assigned adopting grading policy in the McAnulty College and Graduate School of Liberal Arts, as follows:

A	4.0	distinguished scholarly work
A-	3.7	
B+	3.3	
B	3.0	normal progress towards degree
B-	2.7	
C+	2.3	
C	2.0	warning; student subject to departmental action
F	0.0	

**HCE Handbook.** The Center for Healthcare ethics has developed a *Handbook of Policies, Procedures, and Guidelines* to guide students in all curriculum related matters. See the HCE website.

**Academic Integrity.** This syllabus incorporates the “Expectations of Academic Integrity.” Cheating and plagiarism cannot be tolerated. All relevant policies of the McAnulty College and Graduate School of Liberal Arts apply.

**Reasonable Accommodations.**

Students with documented disabilities are entitled to reasonable accommodations if needed. If you need accommodations, please contact the Office of Freshman Development and Special Student Services in 309 Duquesne Union (412-396-6657) as soon as possible. Accommodations cannot always be granted retrospectively.