

College: McAnulty College and Graduate School of Liberal Arts.

Syllabus: Fall, 2021. Revised: 8/7/21.

**HCE-659**, Methods in Health Care Ethics.

**HCE-759**, Methods in HCE (Catholic Program).

Course: Thursday 3:05-5:45pm.

Classroom: Fisher Hall 325.

Office Hours: Thursdays 9:00am-1:00pm, by appointment via telephone or zoom.

Mask wearing is required for office meetings.

Course Instructor: Gerard Magill, Ph.D., The Vernon F. Gallagher Chair for the Integration of Science, Theology, Philosophy and Law and Professor of Healthcare Ethics Duquesne University; e-mail: [magillg@duq.edu](mailto:magillg@duq.edu)

### **COVID VARIANTS.**

Because Covid 19 and its variants continue to cause infections, Provost Dausey now strongly recommends that all individuals wear a mask indoors. Also, based on the Provost's recommendations, **we will plan to wear masks in the classroom for this course**, at least until further notice as the University tracks infection data. The course will be offered in HyFlex mode (permitting students to attend online via zoom or onsite).

### **COURSE DESCRIPTION.**

This course provides a foundational introduction to HCE and to other doctoral degree courses in the healthcare ethics curriculum. The course presents an analysis of dominant methods in healthcare ethics from historical, systematic, organizational and religious perspectives. Practical issues are engaged to illustrate methodological issues.

### **COURSE OBJECTIVES.**

The course focuses on developing Research Competencies in the Research Projects and the Research Essay to prepare students for writing the Doctoral Dissertation. There are three standards adopted in the HCE program for evaluating Research Projects and the Research Essays, as follows: Argument Formation; Literature Integration; Critical Organization and Analysis. The Research Competencies, Projects, and Essay are integrated into the Course Schedule, each described below.

### **LEARNING OUTCOMES.**

a. Fundamental Knowledge.

Students can understand and analyze HCE theory and methods as well as major applied topics

b. Multi-disciplinary Study.

Students can critically relate HCE with multi-disciplinary fields in health care as a diverse and global enterprise (empirical research, law, medicine, philosophy, religion, science, etc).

c. Scholarship.

Students can research and write scholarly essays, teach and communicate effectively, and present academic papers that:

- present cogent argument(s),
- engage scholarly literature, and

- demonstrate critical analysis and organization.
- d. Professionalism.  
Students can integrate academic learning with experiential learning in clinical/organizational rotations as a function of service-learning and development as an HCE professional
  - e. Ethical Leadership.  
Students can function as HCE expert and provide ethical leadership, with the knowledge, skills, competencies and character traits to provide ethics services (ethics consultations, ethics committees, institutional review boards, etc).
  - f. Co-Curricular Practices for Life-long Learning.  
Can foster co-curricular practices for life-long learning to personally value and engage the clinical, organizational, and professional components of HCE in a global context. Practices include: accessing journals and literature for developments in HCE; networking with colleagues in professional associations; fostering a community of scholars in the HCE program, for example, participating in seminars/colloquia/speaker events, preparing for comprehensive exams, writing doctoral projects.

### **RESEARCH COMPETENCIES.**

The course is designed around Research Competencies regarding methods in health care ethics: historical, systematic, organizational, and religious. These research competencies will be integrated into the Research Projects and Research Essay.

1. HISTORY: Historical Development of HCE Methods. The purpose is to understand from an historical perspective how normative methods in HCE have developed. This is explained via class presentations and student group discussion of the assigned texts. See the two weeks listed below. No Research Project is required for this research competency.  
Required Reading:
  - Albert R. Jonsen, *The Birth of Bioethics* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1998), chapters 1-4 and 10-11.
  - Albert R. Jonsen, *A Short History of Medical Ethics* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2008), chapters 7-8.
2. SYSTEMATICS: HCE Methods to Clarify Normativity & Principles. The purpose is to understand from a systematic perspective HCE methods to clarify moral normativity & principles. This is explained via class presentations and student group discussion of the assigned texts. At the end of this section students will submit a 7-page Research Project with minimally 20 note references on the assigned readings. The Research Project will require students to critically engage the assigned readings to (a) master the relevant knowledge and (b) engage in critical reading and writing. The goal is to provide an analysis of HCE methods to clarify moral normativity & principles. See schedule below.  
Required Reading:

- Jeremy Sugarman and Daniel P. Sulmasy, ed. *Methods in Medical Ethics* (Washington, DC: Georgetown University Press, 2010), chapters 1, 3, 5, 7.
  - Tom L. Beauchamp, James F. Childress, *Principles of Biomedical Ethics*, 8<sup>th</sup> ed, (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2019), chapters 1, 4, 5, 6, 7.
3. ORGANIZATIONS: New Ethics Paradigm. The purpose is to present a new ethics paradigm for Healthcare Ethics the combines clinical, organizational, professional, and governance ethics, and to discuss writing guidelines for the final course essay. No Research Project is required for this research competency. Required Readings (on Bb). Gerard Magill, “Ethics Paradigm” (Ch.1) and “Clinical and Organizational Ethics” (Ch.2), in Gerard Magill, Lawrence Prybil, *Governance Ethics in Healthcare Organizations*, Routledge, 2020.
4. RELIGION: Religious Methods in HCE. The purpose is to understand how religious approaches constitute distinct methods in HCE. This is explained via class presentations and student group discussion of the assigned texts. At the end of this section students will submit a 7-page Research Project with minimally 20 note references on the assigned readings. The Research Project will require students to critically engage the assigned readings to (a) master the relevant knowledge and (b) engage in critical reading and writing. The goal is to provide an analysis of religious approaches as distinct methods in HCE. See schedule below.
- Required Readings:
- David F. Kelly, Gerard Magill, Henk ten Have, *Contemporary Catholic Health Care Ethics*, 2<sup>nd</sup> edition (Washington, D.C: Georgetown University Press, 2013), chapters 10, 12-16, 18-20, 22, 25.
  - Aaron L. Mackler, *Introduction to Jewish and Catholic Bioethics: A Comparative Analysis* (Washington, D.C: Georgetown University Press, 2003), chapters 1-4.
- Optional Readings for the Catholic Program.
- Jason T. Eberl, ed., *Contemporary Controversies in Catholic Bioethics* (Springer, 2017); note that the book sections are thematically organized, students could select one topical section.
  - Christopher Kaczor, *A Defense of Dignity* (Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 2013), chapters 10, 11.
5. RESEARCH PROJECTS:
- Research Project #1: Week 6, due Tue. Sep.28, 5pm.
  - Research Project #2: Week 10, due Tue. Oct.26, 5pm.
6. COURSE RESEARCH ESSAY. The course research essay will integrate the research competencies of the course implementing the three standards of the program (argument, literature, critical organization & analysis). The essay will be 25 pages with minimally 100 note references. The course readings in their entirety (not just the assigned chapters indicated above for weekly class

discussion) should be used in the course essay combined with additional readings by the student reflecting the selected topic.

Essay Options. There are two general options for the essay, as follows.

- a. Option 1. Methods of Ethical Decision-making. This can be a theoretical analysis (such as on autonomy & surrogacy), a practical analysis (such as on ethics consultation processes), or a combination of theoretical and practical discourse.
- b. Option 2. Applying Normative Principles to Practical Topics. The normative component can be secular (e.g., burden/benefit calculus) or religious (e.g., double effect). The practical component deals with patient dilemmas (e.g. at the start of life).

Essay Timelines. The following timeline indicates the stages of the essay.

- Week 4: 1-page essay – title, outline, basic bibliography (due Sep.14).
- Week 8: 1-page essay – revised draft (due Oct.12).
- Week 12-13: student essay presentations in class (Nov.11 & Nov.18).
- Week 15, final class: essays to be sent via email (due Dec.2).

Integrating Research Competencies & Research Essay. Drafts of the Essay are discussed in class (below, Schedule, Class Presentations), to be submitted via email. The Essay engages the research competencies (historical, systematic, organizational, religious analysis). The Research Essay should adopt the Course Readings and additional literature related to the selected topic.

Essay Requirements: -

1. Start research from the beginning of the course.
2. Submit Essay Thesis and 1-page outline with basic bibliography.
3. Progress will be reported in the Seminars.
4. Focus on Research Essay progress during the final Seminar.
5. Submit a copy of the essay by date assigned.
6. The essay length should be **25 pages**, double-spacing.
7. Adopt the format of the *Chicago Manual of Style*, as required by the College for dissertation submissions.
8. Provide a Cover Page (name and essay title) plus an Essay Outline.
9. Present a brief Introduction and Conclusion.
10. Notes to the references made in the essay.
  - a. Use end notes (as opposed to foot notes at the bottom of the page).
  - b. Do not use notes for narrative explanations – they belong in the text.
  - c. There should be approx. 100 end notes in the essay.
  - d. Avoid repeat references to pages from the same resource.
11. Bibliography. List all the references in alphabetical order by author. Only list items actually referred to in the essay.
12. Use of online references. Online references are not permitted.
13. Divisions and subdivisions. Use major divisions and subdivisions, evenly distributed throughout the essay, for example:

Title: The ethical justification of mandating patient safety programs in health care organizations.

- I. Introduction.
- II. The organizational ethics problem of medical error.
  - a. The range of medical problems.
  - b. The range of organizational problems.
- III. The ethical principles that guide systems for patient safety.
  - a. Protection of Patients from Medical Error.
  - b. Systems to Enhance Quality Improvement.
- IV. The policy options for stem cell research.
  - a. Federal Oversight: an independent board.
  - b. Joint Commission Accreditation Policy.
- V. The ethical justification of practical policy options for stem cell research.
  - a. Justifying oversight proposal A.
  - b. Justifying accreditation policy B.
- VI. Conclusion.
- VII. End Notes & Bibliography of references cited.

### **COURSE READINGS.**

- Tom L. Beauchamp and James F. Childress, *Principles of Biomedical Ethics*, 8<sup>th</sup> ed, (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2019).
- Albert R. Jonsen, *The Birth of Bioethics* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1998).
- Albert R. Jonsen, *A Short History of Medical Ethics* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2008).
- David F. Kelly, Gerard Magill, Henk ten Have, *Contemporary Catholic Health Care Ethics*, 2<sup>nd</sup> edition (Washington, D.C: Georgetown University Press, 2013).
- Aaron L. Mackler, *Introduction to Jewish and Catholic Bioethics: A Comparative Analysis* (Washington, D.C: Georgetown University Press, 2003).
- Gerard Magill, “Ethics Paradigm” (Ch.1) and “Clinical and Organizational Ethics” (Ch.2), in Gerard Magill, Lawrence Prybil, *Governance Ethics in Healthcare Organizations*, Routledge, 2020
- Jeremy Sugarman and Daniel P. Sulmasy, ed. *Methods in Medical Ethics* (Washington, DC: Georgetown University Press, 2010).

### **SUPPLEMENTARY READINGS FOR CATHOLIC PROGRAM.**

- Jason T. Eberl, ed., *Contemporary Controversies in Catholic Bioethics* (Springer, 2017).
- Christopher Kaczor, *A Defense of Dignity* (Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 2013).

### **SUPPLEMENTARY READINGS (by course instructor, posted in Blackboard):**

- Gerard Magill, “Using the Imagination in Normative Moral Reasoning around the Principle of Double Effect to foster Doctrinal Development in Catholic Bioethics,” in, J. Gielen, ed, *Normativity in Bioethics*, Springer 2020, chapter 6.

- Gerard Magill, “Quality in Ethics Consultations,” *Medicine, Health Care and Philosophy* 16:4 (2013): 761-774.
- Gerard Magill, “Threat of Imminent Death in Pregnancy: A Role for Double Effect Reasoning,” *Theological Studies* 72 (December 2011): 848-878.

**COURSE SCHEDULE, TOPICS, & READINGS.** Green=HCE; Blue=BME.

<u>Dates</u>	<u>Weeks</u>	<u>Weekly Topics</u>	<u>Readings &amp; Weekly Discussion:</u>
8/26	Week-1	<b><u>INTRODUCTION</u></b>	Welcome and Course Overview
		<b><u>1-HISTORY</u></b>	
9/2	Week-2	Roots of Methods	Jonsen, Birth of Bioethics, ch. 1, 2, 3, 4.
9/9	Week-3	Disciplinary Discourse	Jonsen, Birth of Bioethics, ch. 10, 11. Jonsen, Short History, ch. 7, 8.
		<b><u>2-SYSTEMATICS</u></b>	
9/16 *due 9/14	Week-4 Ip Essay Draft	Diversity of Methods	Sugarman, Methods, ch. 1, 3, 5, 7.
9/23	Week-5 BME topic #1	Moral Normativity, incl Justice	Beauchamp, Principles, ch. 1, 4, 7.
		<b><u>3-ORGANIZATIONS</u></b>	
9/30 *due 9/28	Week-6 RP-1 due	Clin/Org/Prof/Gov Ethics Dina/Writing & Eth Prdm	Magill, Governance Ethics, ch.1, ch.2 RP #1 Review
10/7	Week-7 BME essay #1	Burden/Benefit Calculus	Beauchamp, Principles, ch. 5, 6.
		<b><u>4-RELIGION</u></b>	
10/14 *due 10/12	Week-8 Ip Essay Rvsd	Double Effect	Kelly, Catholic, ch. 10, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16.
10/21	Week-9 BME topic #2	Start of Life	Kelly, Catholic, ch. 18, 19, 20, 22, 25.
10/28 *due 10/26	Week-10 RP-2 due	End of Life.	Mackler, Jewish, ch. 1, 2, 3, 4. RP #2 Review
		<b><u>5-COURSE ESSAYS</u></b>	
11/4	Week-11 BME essay #2	Class Replaced	Attend Grefenstette Center Symposium (streaming)
11/11	Week-12 BME topic #3	Student Essays	Research Essay Class Presentations.
11/18	Week-13	Student Essays	Research Essay Class Presentations.

11/25	Holiday	Holiday. No Class	Thanksgiving
12/2 *due	BME essay #3 25p Essay due	Final Class: End of course.	

**NOTE:** No class on Nov.4 (replaced by the DU *Grefenstette Center* Symposium).

**BLACKBOARD.** Blackboard will be used for course communications and access to PowerPoint presentations. Streaming of classes is available for distance students via Go-to-Meeting. **All submissions should be sent to Dr. Magill by email** ([magillg@duq.edu](mailto:magillg@duq.edu)).

**PRIVACY.** To provide distance access to HCE courses, all classes are videotaped and available for later use. The videos are stored via Zoom for subsequent use. The *DU TAP 55 Policy* states at #4: “Refrain from recording (audio or video) other members of the University community without their full advance knowledge and express and/or written consent.” Student participation in the course is construed as reflecting such consent.

**COURSE GRADE.**

There will be no examinations. The course grade will be assigned based on the quality of the course Research Essay and the two Research Projects. The grade will be a combination of 15% for each of the Research Projects (50% for class presentations on project readings and 50% for the written project) and 70% for the final essay. No midterm grades will be assigned. End of term grades will be assigned adopting grading policy in the McNulty College and Graduate School of Liberal Arts, as follows:

A	4.0	distinguished scholarly work
A-	3.7	
B+	3.3	
B	3.0	normal progress towards degree
B-	2.7	
C+	2.3	
C	2.0	warning; student subject to departmental action
F	0.0	

**HCE Handbook.** The Center for Healthcare ethics has developed a *Handbook of Policies, Procedures, and Guidelines* to guide students in all curriculum related matters. See the HCE website.

**Reasonable Accommodations.**

Students with documented disabilities are entitled to reasonable accommodations if needed. If you need accommodations, please contact the Office of Freshman Development and Special Student Services in 309 Duquesne Union (412-396-6657) as soon as possible. Accommodations cannot always be granted retrospectively.

**ACADEMIC INTEGRITY.**

This syllabus incorporates the “Expectations of Academic Integrity.” Cheating and plagiarism cannot be tolerated. All relevant policies of the McAnulty College and Graduate School of Liberal Arts apply.

Students must be attentive to avoiding plagiarism. There is a form of plagiarism that needs special attention, as follows. When a text, e.g. 5 lines, is taken from a resource and used verbatim (with an accompanying reference), the result is plagiarism. Two general rules must be adopted to avoid plagiarism. First, any text from a resource that is three or more words should be in quotations with an accompanying reference. However, HCE faculty discourage an extensive use of quotations in essays insofar as they can detract from the student’s critical analysis. Second, to avoid extensive use of quotations and stimulate analytical interaction with textual resources, we recommend that when a text is adopted from a resource (e.g. 5 lines), flag the text in your essay with quotation marks and some form of colored highlight to remind you that you have adopted an exact quote. Then expand the 5 lines into a paragraph of your critical analysis (e.g. 10-15 lines) that integrates the points in the quote into your own argument, while avoiding use of exact words from the quote. Then remove the highlighted original quote but provide a reference to indicate the resource used. Please strictly comply with avoiding any form of plagiarism. If the faculty member suspects plagiarism, the student’s submission may be run through anti-plagiarism software, which detects various kinds of plagiarism. It is also recommendable to check your own text. Free downloadable software is available on the Internet.

Duquesne University has an Academic Integrity Policy (for Graduates) that pays special attention to the issue of plagiarism, see: <http://www.duq.edu/academics/university-catalogs/2016-2017-graduate/academic-policies/academic-integrity>. If plagiarism is confirmed there will be academic sanctions, varying from lowered grade to dismissal from the program.

### **SYLLABUS ADDENDUM: Biomedical Engineering Students (BME).**

1. Weekly class attendance. Students should attend class via zoom. However, a videotaped option is available. If you cannot attend zoom live, please let Dina Siniora know that you will participate subsequently video ([saniourad@duq.edu](mailto:saniourad@duq.edu)).
2. Course Readings. BME students should focus on just 1 book: Tom L. Beauchamp and James F. Childress, *Principles of Biomedical Ethics*, 8<sup>th</sup> ed, (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2019), especially chapters 1, 4, 5, 6, 7. In addition BME students will select BME readings for their three course essays.
3. BME Meetings: BME students will meet occasionally from 2:30-3:00pm via zoom prior to class for mentoring about course progress. Please plan to meet at 2:30pm on these dates (leave class at 5:15pm): Sep.3, Sep.17, Oct.1, Oct.29, Nov.12, Nov.19.
4. Course Grades. Course grades will average the three course essays or reflect the final course essay grade (whichever is the highest).
5. Research Projects. These are replaced by the three short essays.
6. Course Essays. Instead of Research Project #1 and #2 and the 25 page course essay, BME students should submit **three 5-page essays**, as follows:
  - Submission Dates: Oct.6 (essay #1); Nov3 (essay #2); Dec.5 (essay #3).



- Topic approval: Sep.24 (for Oct.6 essay #1); Oct.22 (for Nov.3 essay #2); Nov.12 (for Dec.5 essay #3).
- Topic Focus: students should combine any BME topic with ethics.
- Writing Guidelines: students must follow the writing guidelines on Blackboard.
- Bibliography & Notes: each essay should have approx. 20 notes connecting BME texts with the *Principles of Biomedical Ethics*
- Draft Submissions: students may send drafts of each essay 1 week prior to Dina Siniora for review and advice ([dina.nasri.siniora@gmail.com](mailto:dina.nasri.siniora@gmail.com)).