

DUQUESNE UNIVERSITY
CENTER FOR HEALTHCARE ETHICS

McANULTY COLLEGE AND GRADUATE SCHOOL OF LIBERAL ARTS

COURSE HCE-655: GLOBAL BIOETHICS

Fall 2018 (version 1 - 2018)



College: McAnulty College and Graduate School of Liberal Arts

Syllabus: HCE-655, **GLOBAL BIOETHICS**, Fall 2018

Course: Tuesday 3:05-5:45 pm., Fisher Hall [location tbd]

Office hours: Appointment, Fisher Hall 300;

Tel. (412) 396-4504

Email: tenhaveh@duq.edu

Course instructor: Henk ten Have, M.D., Ph.D.

Professor, Center for Healthcare Ethics

Duquesne University, 600 Forbes Avenue, Pittsburgh, PA 15282

OUTLINE

One of the new and exciting features of present-day healthcare ethics is that it is increasingly incorporated in an ethical discourse that is globally orientated. Mainstream bioethics with the famous four principles is therefore included in the broader discourse of global bioethics.

This course will study the concept as well as contents of global bioethics. As an international enterprise, global bioethics is closely connected to international human rights law. International organizations such as UNESCO (the United Nations Educational Scientific and Cultural Organization, headquartered in Paris) and WHO (the World Health Organization, headquartered in Geneva) are active in the field of global bioethics, particularly in relation to developing countries. Fundamental bioethical principles have been determined which are shared among all nations and that form a global framework for the analysis of ethical issues around the globe. Global challenges such as pandemics, organ trade, health tourism, human trafficking, lack of access to medication, commercial surrogate motherhood, environmental degradation, and bioterrorism require cooperation and solidarity among countries and different actors

This course will demand to identify and analyze a selected global challenge so that you will be able to explain what global bioethics is and why it is necessary. Extensive attention will be paid to the global ethical framework, including principles such as human dignity, respect for cultural diversity, solidarity, sharing of benefits, and protection of future generations. Finally, the course will demonstrate how to apply global bioethics in policies and practices to address global challenges in diverging contexts and countries, for example in other religious traditions, in low-income countries, and in international cooperation and exchange.

COURSE DESCRIPTION

The course will make students familiar with the recent issues and debates in global bioethics. It will explain basic notions of global bioethics, as identified in the *Universal Declaration on Bioethics and Human Rights*, unanimously adopted by the 193 Member States of UNESCO in 2005. The focus will be on universal principles such as human dignity and human rights, respect for human vulnerability and personal integrity, respect for cultural diversity and pluralism, solidarity and cooperation, social responsibility and health, sharing of benefits, protecting future generations, and protection of the

environment, the biosphere and biodiversity. The course will also study the applications of the fundamental principles in various settings around the world and on diverse topics of current concern.

COURSE OBJECTIVES

Upon completion of the course students should master the following competencies, as should be demonstrated both in specific research projects and presentations, and in the research essay:

- a. Identification and explanation of global bioethical challenges;
- b. Systematic analysis of global bioethical challenges with fundamental ethical principles of global bioethics;
- c. Formulation and examination of practices and policies to address global bioethical challenges.

LEARNING OUTCOMES

The course will contribute to the accomplishment of the general HCE Program Learning Outcomes. All of following Learning Outcomes pertain to HCE-655.

- d. Fundamental Knowledge.
Students can understand and analyze HCE theory and methods as well as major applied topics in a global context.
- e. Multi-disciplinary Study.
Students can critically relate HCE with multi-disciplinary fields in health care as a diverse and global enterprise (empirical research, law, medicine, philosophy, religion, science, etc).
- f. Scholarship
Students can research and write scholarly essays, teach and communicate effectively, and present academic papers that:
 - present cogent arguments,
 - engage scholarly literature, and
 - demonstrate critical thinking and analysis.
- g. Professionalism
Students can integrate academic learning with experiential learning in clinical/organizational rotations as a function of service-learning and development as an HCE professional.
- h. Ethical Leadership
Students can function as HCE expert and provide ethical leadership, with the knowledge, skills, competencies and character traits to provide ethics services (ethics consultations, ethics committees, institutional review boards, etc.).
- i. Co-Curricular Practices for Life-long Learning
Students can foster co-curricular practices for life-long learning to personally value and engage the clinical, organizational, and professional components of HCE in a global context. Practice include: accessing journals and literature for developments in HCE; networking with colleagues in professional associations; fostering a community of scholars in the HCE program, for example, participating in seminars/ colloquia/

speaker events, preparing for comprehensive exams, writing doctoral projects.

COURSE METHODOLOGY

The course will have weekly classes. The general aim of the course, as one of the courses in the HCE graduate program, is to prepare students for the writing of the Dissertation Proposal. In particular, it will focus on the development of research competencies in connection to the area of global bioethics. This aim implies that the emphasis in the course will be on student learning rather than instructor teaching. Students will especially be trained in doing research, critically analyzing scholarly literature, presenting research results and discussing them in a peer setting, and writing critical and analytical papers on relevant topics.

Student will have to focus on three Research Projects:

a) Research project 1: Presentations

Each class will have student presentations related to a specific ethical principle. For these presentations the indicated literature need to be studied. For each class, one student will be assigned to make a presentation of the relevant literature in order to better understand the principles and its implications and applications. Another student will be assigned to play the Devil's Advocate: he or she should critically analyze the relevant principle and highlight its shortcomings and limitations. Both presentations should be minimally 30 minutes. After both presentations the class will engage in a discussion to determine the pros and cons of the principle at stake.

b) Research project 2: Research paper

1. Select a topic from the following list:
 - i. Migration of health professionals
 - ii. Organ trafficking
 - iii. Clinical trials in developing countries
 - iv. Stem cell tourism
 - v. Health tourism
 - vi. Reproductive tourism
 - vii. Biopiracy
 - viii. Food ethics
 - ix. Immigrants and displaced persons
2. Examine the ethical issues related to the topic. You can use the books recommended in this course. You also have to use Gumberg Library to identify relevant publications in order to use them in your paper. Other suggestions for sources are given below.
3. Write a paper of maximum 8 pages (double spaced; not including end notes and bibliography).
4. In the paper, explain the following questions:
 - i. Why is the topic a global bioethics problem?
 - ii. What ethical principles in the UDBHR are relevant in order to

- explain the moral dimensions of the topic?
- iii. What is the most useful and effective approach to address this problem now?
 5. There is no class on October 3; this time if fully available to work on the research paper.
 6. Forward the paper to tenhaveh@duq.edu before Monday October 8.

c) **Research project 3: Course essay**

The course research essay will require students to substantively apply the Course Research Competencies to a particular issue (theoretical or practical).

Requirements:

1. Start to reflect on the thesis of your research essay from the beginning of the course.
2. Thesis and 1-page outline with basic bibliography to be submitted in week 4 (September 18, 2018) (email to tenhaveh@duq.edu).
3. You will receive feedback before and in week 5.
4. Each student will present the research essay (max. 15 minutes) during the final week of the course and submit a copy of the essay by December 15, 2018, 3 pm.
5. The essay length should be **25 pages**, double-spacing, font 12.
6. Students must adopt the format of the *Chicago Manual of Style*, as required by the College for dissertation submissions.
7. Select a research thesis that is the core of your essay and is presented in the Introduction and reflected in the title of the essay. For example, the thesis can be:
 - i. “The ethical principle of respect for human vulnerability is particularly important to protect people in developing countries”,
or
 - ii. “What are the ethical justifications of the principle of benefit sharing”

The title will then be something like:

 - a. Human vulnerability and developing countries
 - b. Ethics and benefit sharing
8. Make a Title page and a separate Table of Content.
9. Present a brief Introduction and Conclusion.
10. Notes to the references made in the essay.
 - i. Use end notes (as opposed to foot notes at the bottom of the page).
 - ii. Do not use notes for narrative explanations – they belong in the main text.
 - iii. There should be approximately 100 end notes in the essay.
 - iv. Check Chicago Manual Style for correct presentation of notes.
11. Bibliography. List all the references in alphabetical order. Only list items actually referred to in the essay. Check Chicago Manual Style for correct presentation of the literature references.
12. Divisions and subdivisions. Use major divisions and subdivisions, evenly distributed throughout the essay, to lay out the sequence of concepts.

13. Use of online references. Online references must be accurately identified with complete web address etc. including the date of access.

COURSE READINGS

The following books are required reading for this course. They are necessary for the classes and presentation and to complete the Research Projects.

- H.A.M.J. ten Have & M.S. Jean (eds.): *The UNESCO Universal Declaration on Bioethics and Human Rights. Background, principles and application*. UNESCO Publishing, Paris, 2009. Free downloadable via: www.henktenhave.org
- Henk ten Have: *Global bioethics: An introduction*. Routledge: London, 2016
- Henk ten Have: *Vulnerability: Challenging bioethics*. Routledge: London, 2016.
- Lynn Hunt: *Inventing human rights. A history*. W. W. Norton & Company: New York and London, 2008.
- Daniel F. Robinson: *Confronting biopiracy. Challenges, cases and international debates*. Earthscan: London and New York, 2012.
- Sara E. Davies: *Global politics of health*. Polity Press: Cambridge (UK), 2010.
- Derek Wall: *The commons in history. Culture, conflict, and ecology*. The MIT Press: Cambridge (MA) and London (England), 2014.
- Robin Attfield: *The ethics of the global environment*. Edinburgh University Press: Edinburgh, 2015, 2nd edition.

RESOURCES AND WEBSITES

Many of the ethical principles and specific topics are analyzed and discussed in two basic reference works in global bioethics:

- *Handbook of Global Bioethics* (Henk ten Have & Bert Gordijn, eds. 2014). In these 4 volumes separate chapters address ethical principles, specific issues, and the state of bioethics in various countries. The Handbook is available through Gumberg Library as an electronic copy so that you can download individual chapters.
- *Encyclopedia of Global Bioethics* (Henk ten Have, ed. 2016). Three volumes present summary introductions into more than 400 topics relevant in contemporary global bioethics. This is an excellent resource to orientate yourself in a specific topic. The book is available in Gumberg Library (in hard copy).

Since almost 30 years there is a specific journal: Global Bioethics (<https://www.tandfonline.com/loi/rgbe20>).

The number of internet resources for global bioethics is growing. Useful sources for cases and problems are:

- www.BioEdge.org
- www.globalbioethics.org
- www.observatoriobioetica.org/categoria/bioethics-news

- www.bioethics.com
- www.sciencedaily.com/news/science_society/bioethics/
- <http://www.globethics.net/>
- <https://www.hrw.org/>

Bioethical issues are often discussed in the media. For example, national newspapers and television frequently report on ethical issues in healthcare. Some countries have specialized journal in healthcare ethics (e.g. The Indian Journal of Medical Ethics; South African Journal of Medical Ethics). A rich source also is the Huffington Post (see for instance: <http://www.huffingtonpost.com/news/bioethics/>). See also newspapers as The Guardian.

Some bioethics centers are especially interested in global bioethics. Their website presents information and cases from around the world. An example: The Center for Bioethics & Human Dignity in the US (<https://cbhd.org/>) and the Centre for Biomedical Ethics in Singapore (<http://cbme.nus.edu.sg/>).

It is also useful to search the websites of UNESCO and WHO:

- <http://en.unesco.org/>
- www.who.int

COURSE SCHEDULE

- | | |
|----------|--|
| Aug. 28 | <u>Topic:</u> Course introduction. Overview of global bioethics, Syllabus, Class Presentations, Research Essay and presentations. |
| Sept. 4 | <u>Topic:</u> The development of global bioethics
<u>Student Presentations #1</u>
<u>Readings:</u> <i>Global bioethics</i> (1-92), <i>Unesco Declaration</i> (17-55), <i>Global politics of health</i> (9-61) |
| Sept. 11 | <u>Topic:</u> Human dignity and human rights
<u>Student Presentations #2</u>
<u>Readings:</u> <i>Global bioethics</i> (93-112), <i>Unesco Declaration</i> (91-98), <i>Global politics of health</i> (62-86), <i>Inventing human rights</i> (15-214) |
| Sept. 18 | <u>Topic:</u> Human vulnerability and personal integrity
<u>Student Presentations #3</u>
<u>Readings:</u> <i>Vulnerability</i> (1-166), <i>Unesco Declaration</i> (155-164)
<u>Deadline:</u> Approval of course essay title and outline due via email |
| Sept. 25 | <u>Topic:</u> Common heritage of humankind
<u>Student Presentations #4</u>
<u>Readings:</u> <i>Global bioethics</i> (113-137), <i>The commons in history</i> (1-136) |

- Oct. 3 **No Class:** Research Project 2: mid-term research paper
- Oct. 9 Topic: **Cultural diversity and pluralism**
Student Presentations #5
Readings: *Unesco Declaration* (199-209), *Global bioethics* (138-210)
- Oct. 16 Topic: **Equality, justice and equity**
Student Presentations #6
Readings: *Unesco Declaration* (173-198), *Global politics of health* (157-186), *Vulnerability* (172-188)
- Oct. 23 **No Class.**
- **Class replaced by Oct. 25-26 Symposium ‘The face of the person who has been trafficked’.**
<http://www.duq.edu/academics/schools/nursing/mcginley-rice-symposium>
 Make sure that you register for this conference in time. Registration is free for Duquesne students. The Symposium is organized by the School of Nursing and will take place at the Duquesne campus.
 - Alternative Reading Report. For students unable to participate, please submit via email to Prof. ten Have by Tuesday October 30 an Alternative reading report as follows: Analyze the usefulness as well as limitations of the principle of respect for human vulnerability in three settings: medical research, elderly care, and end-of-life care. Present this analysis in an essay of 15 pages.
- Oct. 30 Topic: **Solidarity**
Student Presentations #7
Readings: *Vulnerability* (188-196), *Global politics of health* (87-132), *Unesco Declaration* (211-217)
- Nov. 6 Topic: **Social responsibility**
Student Presentations #8
Readings: *Unesco Declaration* (218-230), *Global bioethics* (211-238)
- Nov. 13 Topic: **Sharing of benefits**
Student Presentations #9
Readings: *Unesco Declaration* (231-241), *Confronting biopiracy* (1-76; 101-160)
- Nov. 20 **No class:** Thanksgiving Week
- Nov. 27 Topic: **Future generations**
Student Presentations #10
Readings: *Unesco Declaration* (243-245), *The ethics of the global environment* (1-121)

Dec. 4 Topic: Protection of the environment, biosphere and biodiversity
Student Presentations #11
Readings: *Unesco Declaration* (2247-254), *The ethics of the global environment* (122-242)

Dec. 11 Topic: Course Review and course essay.

Deadline for course essay: 15 December: Submit 25-page research essay (double spacing). Student written evaluation of course.

HCE HANDBOOK. The Center for Healthcare ethics has developed a Handbook of Policies, Procedures, and Guidelines to guide students in all curriculum related matters. The Handbook is available on the website of the Center.

COURSE GRADE. There will be no examinations. The course grade will be assigned based on the quality of the course Research Essay and the two Research Projects. The grade will be a combination of 15% for the first Research Project, 15% for the second Research Project, and 70% for the final course essay. No midterm grades will be assigned. End of term grades will be assigned adopting grading policy in the McAnulty College and Graduate School of Liberal Arts, as follows:

- A 4.0 distinguished scholarly work
- A- 3.7
- B+ 3.3
- B 3.0 normal progress towards degree
- A- 2.7
- C+ 2.3
- C 2.0 warning; student subject to departmental action
- F 0.0

ACADEMIC INTEGRITY. This syllabus incorporates the “Expectations of Academic Integrity.” Cheating and plagiarism cannot be tolerated. All relevant policies of the McAnulty College and Graduate School of Liberal Arts apply.

REASONABLE ACCOMMODATIONS. Students with documented disabilities are entitled to reasonable accommodations if needed. If you need accommodations, please contact the Office of Freshman Development and Special Student Services in 309 Duquesne Union (412-396-6657) as soon as possible. Accommodations cannot always be granted retrospectively.

PRIVACY. To provide distance access to HCE courses, all classes are videotaped and available for later use. The videos are stored on MediaSite in the secure cloud. Duquesne University has a non-disclosure agreement with the MediaSite vendor that protects the privacy and security of the data and students. That means that the videos stored in the

MediaSite cloud are not available to anyone without defined access. The HCE Faculty (i.e., the course Instructor) is the only one who may authorize access to the videos, typically only to students registered for the class.